U.S. HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES COMMITTEE ON SCIENCE, SPACE, AND TECHNOLOGY SUBCOMMITTEE ON ENVIRONMENT SUBCOMMITTEE ON OVERSIGHT

HEARING CHARTER

An Overview of the Nation's Weather Satellite Programs and Policies

Thursday, December 10, 2015 10:00 a.m. – 12:00 p.m. 2318 Rayburn House Office Building

Purpose

The Subcommittees on Environment and Oversight will hold a joint hearing titled *An Overview* of the Nation's Weather Satellite Programs and Policies at 10:00 a.m. on December 10th in room 2318 of the Rayburn House Office Building. Witnesses will provide an update of the operations and development of National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration's (NOAA) polar-orbiting and geostationary weather satellite programs and discuss new policies and procedures for incorporating commercial space data to aid weather forecasting.

<u>Witnesses</u>

- **Dr. Stephen Volz,** Assistant Administrator, National Environmental Satellite, Data, and Information Services, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.
- **Mr. David Powner,** Director, Information Technology Management Issues, Government Accountability Office.

Background

Over the last decade, the Committee on Science, Space, and Technology has monitored the troubled development of NOAA's weather satellite programs, which provide vital input to weather forecasts. The largest NOAA programs are the Joint Polar Satellite System (JPSS) and the Geostationary Operational Environmental Satellite System (GOES).

NOAA's satellite systems form the fundamental base for the nation's weather forecasting ability, providing the majority of data used. A report by the National Research Council found that 80% of the data assimilated into numerical weather models comes from satellites.¹ Satellite data is able to significantly enhance forecasting accuracy. For example, in 2010, data from polar-orbiting satellites helped meteorologists predict the arrival of "Snowmageddon" along the East Coast of the United States five days in advance, and early forecasts of Superstorm Sandy's

¹ National Research Council, national Academy of Sciences, "Fair Weather Report: Effective Partnership in Weather and Cliamte Services," 2003, available at: <u>http://www.nap.edu/catalog/10610/fair-weather-effective-partnerships-in-weather-and-climate-services</u>

track were aided by polar-orbiting satellites, according to a study by the European Centre for Medium-Range Weather Forecasts.²

Due to a series of management problems, delays, and increased costs over many years for NOAA's satellite programs, the United States now faces a likely gap in satellite coverage and data. Without this data, the ability of American weather models to accurately predict weather events will be greatly diminished.

Historical Context

National Polar-orbiting Operational Environmental Satellite System

In the 1960s, the United States began operating two polar-orbiting meteorological satellite systems: one managed by NOAA and another by the Air Force. Polar-orbiting satellites transverse the globe from pole to pole, with each orbit defined by the time of day they pass over the equator: early morning, late morning, and afternoon. Unlike geostationary weather satellites, which offer persistent coverage over an area, each polar-orbiting satellite makes approximately 14 orbits per day and is able to view the entire Earth's surface twice per day.

In 1994, as part of the Clinton-Gore Administration's Reinventing Government initiative, a Presidential Decision Directive required NOAA and the Department of Defense (DOD) to merge the civilian and military polar-orbiting satellite systems into one program, the National Polar-orbiting Operational Environmental Satellite System (NPOESS). To manage the program, DOD, NOAA, and NASA formed a tri-agency Integrated Program Office. Overall responsibility for the management of the system and satellite operations was assigned to NOAA. The DOD was responsible for acquisition of the sensors, satellite bus, and launch vehicle, while NASA was responsible for facilitating the development and incorporation of new technologies.³

By 2009, the life-cycle cost estimate of NPOESS had ballooned to at least \$14.9 billion for four new satellites, the first of which was projected to launch in 2014. In June 2009, an Independent Review Team (IRT) determined that the NPOESS program had a low probability of success.⁴

Joint Polar Satellite System

In February 2010, the Office of Science and Technology Policy announced that the program would be split, with NOAA and the DOD creating their own programs, establishing requirements, and transferring existing NPOESS contracts to new programs.⁵ Satellites flying in orbits to collect early-morning observations would be developed and launched by DOD, while NOAA's Joint Polar Satellite System would collect observations in the afternoon orbit. These

² NOAA, *Suomi NPP: Improving U.S. Weather Forecast Accuracy from Space*, December 3, 2012, available at: <u>http://www.nesdis.noaa.gov/npp_launch.html;</u> European Centre for Medium-Range Weather Forecasts, "Annual Report: 2012," p.5, available at: <u>http://www.ecmwf.int/publications/annual_report/2012/pdf/Annual-report-2012.pdf</u>

³ GAO, "Polar-Orbiting Environmental Satellites: Changing Requirements, Technical Issues, and Looming Data Gaps Require Focused Attention," GAO-12-604, June 2012, p.12. Found at: http://www.gao.gov/assets/600/591643.pdf.

⁴ NOAA, NESDIS, "Joint Polar Satellite System," Fiscal Year 2011 Budget Highlights," Available at: <u>http://www.corporateservices.noaa.gov/nbo/fy11_budget_highlights/JPSS_Budget_Highlights.pdf</u>

⁵ Office of Science and Technology Policy, Restructuring the National Polar-Orbiting Operational Environmental Satellite System, 2010, Available at: <u>http://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/npoess_decision_fact_sheet_2-1-10.pdf</u>

orbits provide adequate coverage of the Earth during various times of the day and collect information for weather models.

In 2010, NOAA estimated that the life cycle costs of the JPSS program would be approximately \$11.9 billion. Though data monitoring requirements for the program had not changed, NOAA's JPSS program office made plans to remove key requirements to keep the program within the prescribed budget. Meanwhile, DOD decided to terminate its program and reassess its requirements.⁶

The following table from GAO compares the planned costs, schedule and scope of NPOESS and JPSS over time. 7

Key area	NPOESS after it was restructured (as of June 2006)	NPOESS prior to being disbanded (as of February 2010)	JPSS program (as of May 2010)	JPSS program (as of June 2012)	JPSS program (as of September 2013)
Life cycle	1995-2026	1995-2026	2010-2024	2010-2028	2010-2025
Estimated life cycle cost	\$12.5 billion	\$13.95+ billion ^a	\$11.9 billion (which includes about \$2.9 billion spent through fiscal year 2010 on NPOESS)	\$12.9 billion (which includes about \$3.3 billion spent through fiscal year 2011 on NPOESS and JPSS)	\$11.3 billion (which includes about \$4.3 billion spent through fiscal year 2012 on NPOESS and JPSS)
Number of satellites	4 (in addition to S-NPP)	4 (in addition to S-NPP)	2 (in addition to S-NPP)	2 (in addition to S-NPP)	2 (in addition to S-NPP)
Number of orbits	2 (early morning and afternoon; would rely on European satellites for midmorning orbit data)	2 (early morning and afternoon; would rely on European satellites for midmorning orbit data)	1 (afternoon orbit) (DOD and European satellites would provide early and midmorning orbits, respectively)	1 (afternoon orbit) (DOD and European satellites would provide early and midmorning orbits, respectively)	1 (afternoon orbit) (DOD and European satellites would provide early and midmorning orbits, respectively)
Launch schedule	S-NPP by Jan. 2010 First satellite (C1) by Jan. 2013 C2 by Jan. 2016 C3 by Jan. 2018 C4 by Jan. 2020	S-NPP no earlier than Sept. 2011 C1 by March 2014 C2 by May 2016 C3 by Jan. 2018 C4 by Jan. 2020	S-NPP—no earlier than Sept. 2011 JPSS-1 available in 2015 JPSS-2 available in 2018	S-NPP—successfully launched in Oct. 2011 JPSS-1 by March 2017 JPSS-2 by Dec. 2022	S-NPP—successfully launched in Oct. 2011 JPSS-1 by March 2017 JPSS-2 by Dec. 2021
Number of sensors	S-NPP: 4 sensors C1: 6 sensors C2: 2 sensors C3: 6 sensors C4: 2 sensors	S-NPP: 5 sensors C1: 7 sensors ^b C2: 2 sensors C3: 6 sensors C4: 2 sensors	S-NPP: 5 sensors JPSS-1 5 sensors ^c JPSS-2: 5 sensors	S-NPP: 5 sensors JPSS-1: 5 sensors JPSS-2: 5 sensors Free flyer-1 and-2: 1 sensor and 2 user services systems ⁴	S-NPP: 5 sensors JPSS-1: 5 sensors JPSS-2: 5 sensors [®] No free flyers ^f

Figure 1: Temporal Comparison of NPOESS and JPSS⁸

Source: GAO analysis of NOAA, DOD, and task force data. | GAO-15-47

³Although the program baseline was \$13.95 billion in February 2010, we estimated in June 2009 that this cost could grow by about \$1 billion. In addition, officials from the Executive Office of the President stated that they reviewed life cycle cost estimates from DOD and the NPOESS program office of \$15.1 billion and \$16.45 billion, respectively.

^bIn May 2008, the NPOESS Executive Committee approved an additional sensor—Total and Spectral Solar Irradiance Sensor—for the C1 satellite.

^cThe five sensors are the Advanced Technology Microwave Sounder, Clouds and the Earth's Radiant Energy System (CERES), Cross-Track Infrared Sounder, Ozone Mapping and Profiler Suite, and Visible Infrared Imaging Radiometer Suite. NOAA committed to finding an alternative spacecraft and launch accommodation for the Total and Spectral Sodar Irradiance Sensor, the Advanced Data Collection System, and the Search and Rescue Satellite-Aided Tracking system.

^dNOAA planned to launch two stand-alone satellites, called free flyer satellites, to accommodate the Total and Spectral Solar Irradiance Sensor, the Advanced Data Collection System, and the Search and Rescue Satellite-Aided Tracking system.

^eIn its fiscal year 2014 budget request, NOAA transferred responsibility for two sensors to NASA—the Radiation Budget Instrument (formerly known as CERES) and OMPS-L and plans to accommodate these sensors on the JPSS-2 satellite as long as they do not impact the likelihood of mission success.

¹NOAA canceled Free flyer-1 and established Free flyer-2 as a new program outside the JPSS program. This new program, called the Solar Irradiance, Data, and Rescue (SIDAR) mission, is to accommodate the Total and Spectral Solar Irradiance Sensor, the Advanced Data Collection System, and the Search and Rescue Satellite-Aided Tracking system.

By 2011, NOAA and NASA had established separate, but co-located JPSS program offices, each with different roles and responsibilities. NOAA is responsible for programmatic

⁶ GAO-12-604, June 2012, p.12.

⁷ GAO, "Polar Weather Satellites: NOAA Needs to Prepare for Near-Term Data Gaps," GAO-15-47, December 2014, p.12. Found at: <u>http://www.gao.gov/assets/670/667581.pdf</u>.

⁸ GAO, "Polar Weather Satellites: NOAA Needs to Prepare for Near-Term Data Gaps," GAO-15-47, December 2014, p.12. Found at: <u>http://www.gao.gov/assets/670/667581.pdf</u>.

activities related to the JPSS satellite development, including managing requirements, budgets, and interactions with satellite data users. NASA is responsible for the development and integration of sensors, satellites, and ground systems.

The Suomi National Polar-orbiting Partnership (S-NPP) satellite was launched in October 2011, the first of a new generation of satellites. S-NPP collects remotely-sensed land, ocean, and atmospheric data during the afternoon orbit.

The scheduled launch date for JPSS is currently March 2017.

Geostationary Satellite System

In addition to polar-orbiting satellites, NOAA also operates Geostationary Observational Environmental Satellites (GOES). NOAA's GOES satellites operate from a geosynchronous orbit 22,300 miles above the Earth, which means they orbit the equatorial plane of the Earth at a speed matching the Earth's rotation. This vantage point allows the satellites to essentially 'hover' continuously over one position on the surface of the Earth and serve as a fixed eye on the continental United States though with limited coverage of the Earth's poles.

The GOES system operated by NOAA utilizes two satellites – one fixed on the eastern United States and the other on the western United States. At any given time, the GOES system also includes a third on-orbit 'spare' called into duty either as an emergency back-up to the primary satellites, or naturally sequenced into operations once an older satellite's service has degraded.

The next-generation of the GOES satellites, known as the GOES-R, is currently under development. GOES-R is expected to significantly improve weather data and will be able to transmit that data at faster rates to enhance the quality and timeliness of information to the user.

Life cycle cost estimates for the GOES-R series now stand at \$10.86 billion through 2036 – an increase of \$3.2 billion over the estimate for a two satellite system in 2007. The first launch of the series has slipped due to issues with various components and NOAA now expects to launch GOES-R in October 2016.

The following table illustrates key changes to the program since August 2006.

Figure 2: Key Changes to the GOES-R Program ⁹	Figure 2:	Key Changes	to the GOES-R	Program ⁹
--	-----------	--------------------	---------------	-----------------------------

	August 2006 (baseline program)	September 2006	November 2007	February 2011	August 2013
Number of satellites	4	2	2	4	4
Instruments	Advanced Baseline Imager Geostationary Lightning Mapper Magnetometer Space Environmental In-Situ Suite Solar Imaging Suite (which included the Solar Ultraviolet Imager, and Extreme Ultraviolet/X-Ray Irradiance Sensor) Hyperspectral Environmental Suite	Suite Solar Ultraviolet Imager Extreme Ultraviolet/X-Ray Irradiance Sensor 	No change	No change	No change
Number of satellite products	81	68	34 baseline 34 optional	34 baseline 31 optional	34 baseline 31 optional
Life cycle cost estimate (in then-year dollars)	\$6.2 billion – \$11.4 billion (through 2034)	\$7 billion (through 2028)	\$7.67 billion (through 2028)	\$10.86 billion (through 2036) ^a	\$10.86 billion (through 2036)
Estimated launch dates for GOES-R and GOES-S	GOES-R: September 2012 GOES-S: April 2014	GOES-R: September 2012 GOES-S: April 2014	GOES-R: December 2014 GOES-S: April 2016	GOES-R: October 2015 GOES-S: February 2017	GOES-R: by March 2016 GOES-S: by June 2017 ^b

Source: GAO analysis of NOAA data. | GAO-15-60

^aBased on NOAA's fiscal year 2012 budget estimate, \$7.64 billion of this cost estimate was for the first two satellites in the series, GOES-R and GOES-S. The cost for the remaining two satellites—GOES-T and GOES-U—was estimated at \$3.22 billion.

^bProgram documentation shows that the launch commitment dates were changed to the first quarter of 2016 and the second quarter of 2017, respectively. The launch dates in this chart reflect the latest month in which launch can occur and still meet the launch commitment dates.

Commercial Space Policy

On September 1, 2015, NOAA published a draft Commercial Space Policy.¹⁰ The draft document was open for public review and comment for one month, closing October 1, 2015. The policy establishes "broad principles for the use of commercial space-based approaches for NOAA's observational requirements."¹¹ The policy also sets up the different responsibilities for NOAA offices and formulates a broad process. NOAA received 15 comments on the draft policy. The Agency is now examining those comments and plans to formulate a final policy later this year, as well as to establish more detailed processes for private-sector companies seeking to provide data to NOAA.

 ⁹ GAO, "Geostationary Weather Satellites: Launch Date Nears, but Remaining Schedule Risks Need to be Addressed," GAO-15-60, December 2014, p.12. Found at: <u>http://www.gao.gov/assets/670/667565.pdf</u>
 ¹⁰ NOAA, Office of Space Commercialization, "NOAA Releases Draft Commercial Space Policy," September 1,

2015. Available at: <u>http://www.space.commerce.gov/noaa-releases-draft-commercial-space-policy/</u>¹¹ NOAA, Draft Commercial Space Policy, September 1, 2015, Available at:

http://www.regulations.gov/#!docketDetail;D=NOAA-NMFS-2015-0109

Additional Reading

- Government Accountability Office, "Polar Weather Satellites: NOAA Needs to Prepare for Near-Term Data Gaps," GAO-15-47, January 2015, Available at: <u>http://www.gao.gov/products/GAO-15-47</u>
- Government Accountability Office, "Geostationary Weather Satellites: Launch Date Nears, but Remaining Schedule Risks Need to be Addressed," GAO-15-60, January 2015, Available at: <u>http://www.gao.gov/products/GAO-15-60</u>
- NOAA, Draft Commercial Space Policy, September 1, 2015, Available at: http://www.regulations.gov/#!docketDetail;D=NOAA-NMFS-2015-0109